

ES/IB 311 - MULTI-SECTOR STRATEGIES FOR SUSTAINABILITY

IES Abroad Freiburg

DESCRIPTION:

The word sustainability is found in urban development plans, corporate, public and civil sector annual reports, academic curricula, stock market indices and myriad of other messaging and publicity sources. Many professionals working in in the field suggest that over the last three decades the term sustainability has been so widely used in so many contexts, that the term has become void of any meaning.

Impact Sustainability refers to measurable and long term positive change driven by civil society, the private sector and government that contribute toward the longevity of our planet. Actors practicing impact sustainability demonstrate tangible and innovative approaches to improving ecosystems, reducing the impacts of climate change and health threats and ensure limited use of resources, without impeding an "acceptable" amount of economic growth. This course will introduce students to concepts and practice of sustainability efforts that have the highest potential for long-term impact and systemic change.

While in Freiburg, students will discover, observe and live impact sustainability on a daily basis. This course will introduce the concepts on a global level. They will have the opportunity to understand and embrace sustainable governance and practices in Freiburg, Germany and Europe, as well as link them to practices and implementation strategies in their home regions.

CREDITS: 3 credits

CONTACT HOURS: 45 hours

LANGUAGE OF INSTRUCTION: English

PREREQUISITES: A course in Environmental Studies or International Business.

ADDITIONAL COST: none

METHOD OF PRESENTATION:

- Lectures
- Inspiring and instructional video Clips
- Student presentations, exchange and discussion
- Student simulations, scenarios and stakeholder-led problem-solving
- Study of current events demonstrating societies challenges (environment, climate, social, conflict, poverty) and application to the topics
- Workshop activities within class
- Field study to learn from local innovators in the Freiburg region as well as applying EU Member States Study Trip observations to course content

REQUIRED WORK AND FORM OF ASSESSMENT:

- Course participation 20 %
- Student Statement 5 %
- Case Study 15 %
- Position Paper 15 %
- Presentation 15 %
- Group Written Assignment 15 %
- Final Exam 15 %

Course Participation – 20 %

Students are expected to participate in debates with questions related to the readings and Students are required to complete all reading assignments and will be expected to demonstrate this through regularly assigned homework, pop quizzes, and/or insightful



and relevant contributions to in-class discussion. All these components will count toward the class participation grade. Participation also applies to course-related trips, outings and/or special events in and around Freiburg. A rubric for participation is available in the appendix and on Moodle.

Student Statement - 5 %

"Sustainability Challenges and How Sectors (might) View Them" (Approx. 500 words – Moodle Submission)

Part 1. - 3-4 sentences

Your personal view on "sustainability" and where or how society (nation or culture of your choice) is making progress or no making progress toward being "sustainable". (This lets you provide your personal opinions, please do not reiterate class discussion or ppt notes. Your original ideas and position are required). (approx 2-3 paragraphs)

Part 2. 3-4 sentences

You will provide and describe one specific sustainability problem and why you believe that it will be a challenge to address and solve. (approx. 2-3 paragraphs.) Please be specific. i.e. "climate-change" is too global of a response, rather than "ongoing large sovereign wealth investment in fossil fuels" which is specific.

Part 3

Provide 2-3 lines (per sector) on the perspective the following three sectors on your chosen problem in part 2 above:

- a) Civil society (people / communities/NGOs....other)
- b) The private sector
- c) The public sector
- d) Other sector

Case Study - 15 %

This includes:

Students will be given a pre-selected case study and will include the following points

A Case Summary

Identification of core and and one peripheral sustainability problem in the case. The key innovation behind the case? Identification of the direct stakeholders named in the case. Identification the peripheral stakeholders and their key stake or interest.

The case's key weaknesses.

Another line of action not included in your research that may help to address the problem while addressing the maximum of stakeholder interests possible.

Details in Lecture 1 and on Moodle.

The case study is a group project to be handed on Moodle (see assignment description on Moodle). (Maximum 3 pages)

Position Paper for Problem Resolution: Stakeholder Interests and Strategy – 15 % (10% for paper + 5% for first round of revisions) A specific problem or risk to sustainability that affects multi-sectors of society will be given to students to solve within an action plan.

Using these problems, students will be given a stakeholder profile and demonstrating their understanding of independent research and course content mid-way through the module, they will prepare a stakeholder position paper to state the following:

The specific challenges that the sustainability risk and problem hold for them (in their stakeholder role)

Two specific ideas on addressing the problems that affect them (above)

An integrated three-step strategy to implementing their two ideas (above)

Please support strategies based on external research (with referencing) i.e. when proposing a "proven" strategy This assignment must demonstrate mid-term module knowledge of course content .

Sustainability / Sustainable Development

Resistance to sustainability due to perceived risk,



Types of governance and related policy (where appropriate) that impact the stakeholder Elements of innovation (social, environmental etc.) and where appropriate social entrepreneurship Considerations for financing of proposed ideas for the solving the sustainability problem. Leadership + Empathy

Revisions

Based on the quality of requested revisions as per instructor feedback to help refine your profile and clarify issues for the presentation below.

This paper will serve as presentation material for the assignment "Presentations for Problem Resolution: Stakeholder Meeting, Scenarios and Strategies" below and used as a tool / preparation for the stakeholder meeting. Submit with mark-ups / change tracking.

Presentations for Problem Resolution: Stakeholder Meeting, Scenarios and Strategies -15~%

This course deliverable serves to put students' written stakeholder position paper (4. above) into action. All students hold a different stakeholder profile, yet face the same problems to the identified sustainability risk. Students will come together to discuss, exchange and determine a strategy for problem resolution. For this "presentation"-based activity students will be graded on the presentation of their revised position paper but in particular based on input into the discussions and achieving meeting goals. The individual presentations will be held during the first phase of the stakeholder meeting.

Peer and instructor feedback and questions will be submitted in writing to each student following their presentation. Revisions are to be submitted on Moodle with mark-ups / change tracking.

Group Written Assignment: Post Stakeholder Meeting Action Plan – 15 % (10% for draft, 5% for revisions)

Following the Stakeholder Meeting, student positions, resolutions and strategy and time-based action plan from 0 to 2 years must be documented. This is a group written submission and all parties must agree on the final document and will demonstrate students' ability to document diverse multi-stakeholder view in a consensus-based, documented action plan. This consensus building activity will be held during assigned sessions to support the written portion of the assignment: the Action Plan

(See class and assignment schedule or Moodle for submission dates. Group format will depend on the number of class participants)

(Maximum 10 pages – Moodle Submission)

Final Exam - 15%

This final exam will cover all content and concepts covered during the entire course / module. The exam format will be communicated to the class for preparation and will be administered during Session 20.

The Moodle Link to each session will provide clear guidelines as to what content and knowledge that will be covered in the final exam to permit for final exam preparation as you do your readings for each session and throughout the course.

LEARNING OUTCOMES:

By the end of the course students will be able to:

- Define (and critique) sustainability as a term and observe sustainability initiatives from different contexts, sectors and cultures.
- Communicate the ecological, economic and social dimensions of the sustainability field.
- Develop an awareness of the policy role in developing markets for social and ecological change through economic value.
- Identify and tag leadership characteristics key to internationalizing organizational change via sustainable governance and practice, including the challenge of overcoming resistance to change.
- Demonstrate the ability to identify, and critically evaluate sustainability practices within an organization.
- Analyze the advantages and limitations of sustainability performance measurement.
- Tell a "sustainability story" via an acquired ability to give a pitch on a personal sustainability issue and communicate positions and beliefs through effective writing, group work and consensus building.



- Communicate the strategic importance of sustainability to an individual or organization (civil society, public and private sectors).
- Formulate a personal contribution to change the student's own role in developing and nurturing sustainable community, business, campus etc. Encourage others to emulate such actions.

Attendance Policy (see also the detailed version on Moodle ESS Academics page)

IES Abroad courses are designed to utilize the unique contribution of the instructor; the lecture/discussion format is regarded as the **primary mode of instruction**. Therefore, attendance is mandatory. Any unexcused absence will incur a penalty on your final course grade. Deductions from grades due to absences are based on contact hours (= 45 minutes). Any unexcused absence will result in a penalty on your final course grade (1 unexcused contact hour absence - 1%, 2nd unexcused contact hour absence -2%, 3rd unexcused contact hour absence — 3% and so on). Any student who misses more than 25% of a course (= more than 11 contact hours), whether the absences are excused or are unexcused, will receive an "F" as the final grade in the course.

ESS courses may have entire course blocks that take place on one day in addition to longer field trips that count for several contact hours. In this case, the actual missed contact hours are added together, and the absences are sanctioned according to the rule above. If you are late for a planned field trip, you will generally not be able to join the trip, since the group needs to leave on time and cannot wait for one person. Punctuality is therefore essential here. If you miss a class, it is **your responsibility** to make up on everything that was covered in class. Tests/presentations missed during unexcused absences **cannot be made up.**

Arriving late for class: Punctuality is important for the planned course schedule. If you are late for class, the late time will be recorded and added up at the end of the course. You will receive a grade reduction based on the accumulated amount of missing contact hours (as outlined above; i.e., if you were late by 15 minutes on 3 days, your grade would be reduced by 1% for 1 missing contact hour).

LATE OR FAILURE SUBMISSION OF ASSIGNMENTS: Late submission of assignments or failure of submission of assignment results in the grade F of that particular assignment. This does not apply to late or non-submission due to illness with an excused absence.

Excused absence: Please call the IES Center before the start of your first class if you are ill and would like to be excused from your course, as outlined in the "Cell Phone and Attendance Policy" handed out during orientation. Student Affairs staff will decide whether your absence can be excused directly or whether a doctor's note is necessary. Absences due to religious observances and family emergencies may be excused at the discretion of the Center Director, with written approval. A petition for an excused absence due to a religious holiday needs to be submitted 2 weeks in advance. If permission is granted, the student needs to inform the Academic Dean, the Student Affairs Team and their instructors. Absences due to private travel or travel delays cannot be excused, even with advanced notice.

ACADEMIC INTEGRITY CODE:

Students are expected to abide by the IES Abroad Code of Academic Integrity. The detailed IES Abroad academic integrity code can be accessed on Moodle.

All work submitted by a student for academic credit should constitute the student's own original work. Regardless of the quality of work, plagiarism will result in a failing grade for the course and/or an academic review and possible expulsion from the program. Plagiarism may be broadly defined as "copying of materials from sources, without acknowledging having done so, claiming other's ideas as one's own without proper reference to them, buying materials such as essays/exams, and using Al-generated content without disclosure."

As AI tools continue to evolve, learning how to use them responsibly is an important emerging skill. Some of our courses allow students to explore the use of generative artificial intelligence (GAI) tools such as ChatGPT for some assignments and assessments. The instructor of each course will communicate whether GAI may be used in a course and provide specific guidelines and procedures for its appropriate use.

Updated information on your course and readings, including additional readings from journalistic articles, can be found on the Moodle platform at https://moodle.iesabroad.org/login/index.php



CONTENT:

Week	Content	Assignments and Readings
Week 1	Session 1: Introduction: Course Description and Introductory Workshop This session will focus on group introductions as well as a review of the course content, evaluation, student deliverables and learning outcomes. Through a participatory workshop, we will exchange on views and understandings to of sustainability and threats to its impact on the long-term. This exercise will prepare students for their first assignment: "Student Statement: Weakness, Caveats and Threats to the term "Sustainability"	Required Preparation: • Review Course Syllabus
	Session 1: The Evolution of "Sustainability" How do you define "sustainability"? Government, civil society, business and academia all use the term for a common purpose, or do they? Has a diverse pool of sectors made the term vague, self-interest-based megatrend and a deviation from the early common vision of sustainable development set out by the Club of Rome and the Brundtland Report? In this session and to set the context for the module, we will look at the evolution of the term sustainability and sustainable development its relation to society's sectors.	Required Reading: • Kates, Parris, and Leiserowitz, What Is Sustainable Development?, pp. 8–21. Recommended Reading: • Markevich, The Evolution of Sustainability. • IISD Website, International Institute for Sustainable Development.
	Session 2: Change resistance, risk perception and strategies for action. Very few actors in society would stand-out against the principles of sustainable development. Why then, are we making only limited progress in key sustainability areas such as climate, ecological degradation, resource depletion, food quality and democracy and inclusion? In this section we will identify perceptions of risk and other barriers that prevent action for impact.	Required Reading: Gilford, The dragons of inaction, pp. 290-302. Lourdel, Martin, and Bérerd, Overcoming obstacles. Recommended Readings: Doppelt, Leading Change Toward Sustainability, chapter 5. van Vugt and Griskevicius, Going green?.
	Session 2: Governance Models that Support High Impact Sustainability Governance for sustainability implies more than just government. We will look at the role of governance in the sustainability space and in what way good	Required Reading: Corfee-Morlot, et al., Cities, Climate Change and Multilevel Governance, pp. 46-84. UNEPFI and WBCSD, Translating Environmental, Social and Governance Factors into Sustainable Business Value.



	governance can increase impact for sustainable development in all sectors.	Recommended Reading: Roy and Tisdell, Good governance in sustainable development, pp. 1310 – 1325. Puppim de Oliveira, Green Economy and Good Governance, pp. 3- 22.
	Session 3: Strategy, Sustainability and Best Practice in the Public Sector Space The public sector has great power to influence sustainable practices via policy and practice. We will examine best practice policy (2-3 varied sectors) and how public-led efforts can impact climate change, biodiversity, energy use, product and market development, to name a few.	Required Reading: • Birney et al., Stepping up, pp. 1-18. Recommended Reading: • Case Studies from ICLEI Local Governments for Sustainability.
	Session 4: The Role of Innovation We will discuss what forms of innovation drive sustainable development and look at the qualities for innovators in the sustainability sector.	Required Reading: • European Commission, Social Innovation and the Environment, pp. 1-41. • Brown and Wyatt, Design Thinking for Social Innovation, pp. 30-35. Recommended Readings: • Gjoksi, Innovation and sustainable development.
	Session 5: Strategy, Sustainability and Best Practice in the Private Sector Space This session will cover the impetus for private sector involvement in the sustainability space and consider why the private sector has engaged corporate social responsibility, why the industry, commercial and service sectors must engage further and what will it take for them to go beyond reporting (or greenwashing) to significantly change the way they "do business".	Assignment: • Students will each review interest-based Corporate Social Responsibility case for class discussion. Possible case studies may be found on: • Review Model Behavior 20 Business Model Innovations for Sustainability. (http://www.sustainability.com/) • The Corporate Social Responsibility Newswire. (http://www.csrwire.com/) • Corporate Social Responsibility Watch. (http://www.csrwatch.com/)
Week 2	Session 6: Business Practices and Social Enterprise: Do they impact sustainability? Moving on from social entrepreneurship, we will look at how all sectors can engage in market and profit-driven approaches for scaling sustainability solutions to local and global problems.	Required Reading: • Lowe, Scoring Sustainability, pp. 15-16. • CSR Wire Recommended Reading: • Marquis, and Park, Inside the Buy-One Give-One Model.



As progress toward linking profit to social incomes increases, so does the importance of measuring impact with data and metrics.	 Mitra and Borza, <u>The Role Of Corporate Social</u> <u>Responsibility in Social Entrepreneurship</u>, pp. 63-76.
Session 7: Leadership for Impact Sustainability This session will introduce the role of leadership in creating entrepreneurial and innovative approaches to solving the ecological and human problems. What role does leadership play in the sustainability movement? How does leadership act as a catalytic function of system change needed where the status quo is no longer "working". Students will reflect upon the tools, skills and experiences that are best suited to their styles and goals, and how they might support and lead change?	
Session 8: Social Entrepreneurship: The potential of civil society This session will help students understand the concept of social entrepreneurship and how this high impact approach can flip problems into opportunities and drive systemic change for the good of the planet.	Required Reading: Bornstein, How to Change the World, pp. 1-60. Recommended Readings: Martin and Osberg, Social Entrepreneurship, pp. 28-39. www.ashoka.org Schwartz and Rippling, How Social Entrepreneurs Spread Innovation throughout the World.
Session 8: Social Entrepreneurship 2 We will take the concepts seen in session 7 and look more closely at case studies of social	Assignment: • Students will read and summarize assigned social entrepreneurship cases for class discussion entrepreneurs working in the sustainability sector and how their approach, models and commitment drive change. Possible case studies may be found on: • Schwab Foundation for Social Entrepreneurship (http://www.schwabfound.org/) • The Skoll Foundation http://www.skollfoundation.org/
Session 9: Financing for Sustainability, Part 1 + 2 Everyone agrees that it must get done, but who will pay for it? This session will look at the different forms and mechanisms of finance and resource flows for sustainable projects to shool gives and semantics as	Required Reading: • The World Bank International Finance Corporation, MONEYMOVES TWO, pp. 1-25. Recommended Readings

sustainable projects, technologies, and companies as

well as accompanying investment models.

Brest and Born, When Can Impact Investing

Create Real Impact?.

OECD, Social Impact Investment.



	Session 10: The Rising Potential of Sustainable, Social and Green Purchasing and Procurement This session will focus on sustainable procurement policy and practices and how they play a key role institutionalizing green practices as well as impacting supply chains, products and markets.	Required Reading: • ICLEI, Local Governments for Sustainability. Recommended Readings: • INSEAD, Value of Sustainable Procurement Practices.
Week 3	Session 11: Student Presentations: Stakeholder Meeting Stakeholders sharing a common sustainability risk will come together to state their interest, vision and ideas for problem resolution. The goal of this exercise is to introduce and understand multi-disciplinary risks and interests caused by the class defined problem. A clash of interests and personalities is expected as well as students' ability to draw from what they have learned to date during this module to work toward a common goal and action plan.	Required Preparation: • Finalization of the position paper which is to be submitted to the course professor before the meeting begins.
	Session 12: Sustainability in the EU, Germany and in Freiburg – What do you know?	Required Reading: • Student-led readings based on student knowledge and interest, when possible guest speaker.
	Session 13: Strategic Meeting and for finalizing Stakeholder Action Plan The students will present their individual position papers during this meeting.	Assignment: • All students assume their assigned stakeholder profile, working toward solving problems to the identified sustainability risk. Students will come together to discuss, exchange and determine a strategy for problem resolution. Student presentations are graded based on improvements to their position paper but in particular based on input into the discussions and achieving meeting goals.
	Session 14: Final Exam Course Wrap-up - Course Evaluations - Sustainability Statements	

COURSE-RELATED TRIPS:

• Visits to suitable companies, start-ups or initiatives in Freiburg and the surrounding area (depending on actual availability).

REQUIRED READINGS:

• Birney, A. et al. "Stepping up: a framework for public sector leadership on sustainability," in *Forum For the Future. UK.,* February 2010. URL: https://www.criticaleye.com/inspiring/insights-servfile.cfm?id=2136



- Bornstein, D. <u>How to Change the World: Social Entrepreneurs and the Power of New Ideas</u>. New York: Oxford University press., 2004, pp 1-60.
- Brown. T and J. Wyatt. "Design Thinking for Social Innovation," in Stanford Social Innovation Review, (2010), pp 30-35.
- Clement, S., Watt, J. and Semple, A. <u>The Procura+ Manual A Guide to Implementing Sustainable Procurement</u>., Freiburg i. Brsg.: ICLEI. European Secretariat GmbH, 2007.
- Corfee-Morlot, J. et al. "Cities, Climate Change and Multilevel Governance," in <u>OECD Environmental Working Papers</u>, 14, (2009.
- European Commission. "Social Innovation and the Environment," in <u>Science for Environment Policy Report</u>. Issue 10 (2014), pp. 3-25.
- Gilford, R. "The dragons of inaction: psychological barriers that limit climate change mitigation and adaptation," in American Psychologist, 66/4, (2011), pp. 290-302.
- Kates,R., Parris, T. and Leiserowitz, A. "What Is Sustainable Development? Goals, Indicators, Values, And Practice", in Environment: Science and Policy for Sustainable Development, 47/3, pp. 8-21.
- Lourdel, N. and Martinand O. "Overcoming obstacles to understanding sustainable development an approach based on personal experiences" in <u>Conference: Engineering Education in Sustainable Development (EESD 2006)</u>, Lyon: 2006.
- Lowe, P. "Scoring Sustainability" in Stanford Social Innovation Review, Spring (2014). (72 pages)
- United Nations Environmental Program. Translating Environmental, Social and Governance Factors into Sustainable Business Value. United Nations Investment, Publications, 2010.
- World Bank Group. "Money Moves two: how private sector finance can work for a sustainable future" in World Bank Working papers, 1 (2013). URL: http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/725131468162285049

RECOMMENDED READINGS:

- Antonakis J. "Leadership: What is it and how it is implicated in strategic change?," in <u>International Journal of Management</u> <u>Cases</u>, 8/4 (2006), pp. 4-20.
- Ashford, N. "An Innovation-Based Strategy for a Sustainable Environment" in <u>ZEW Economic Studies</u>, 10 (2000), pp 67-107.
- Brest, P. and Born, K. "When Can Impact Investing Create Real Impact?" in Stanford Social Innovation Review. Spring (2014)
- Brown. T and Wyatt, J. "Design Thinking for Social Innovation" in <u>Stanford Social Innovation Review</u>. Winter (2010).
- Doppelt, R. Leading Change Toward Sustainability: A Change-Management Guide for Business, Government, and Civil Society, 2nd Edition. Milton Park: Taylor & Francis, 2010.
- EcoVadis, Price Waterhouse Coopers and INSEAD Social Innovation Center. <u>Value of Sustainable Procurement Practices</u>. 2010. URL: https://resources.ecovadis.com/i/1100686-value-of-sustainable-procurement-practices/9?
- Gjoksi, N. "Innovation and sustainable development: Linkages and perspectives for policies in Europe," in <u>ESDN Quarterly</u> <u>Report. European Sustainable Development Network.</u> June (2011).
- ICLEI: Case Studies from ICLEI Local Governments for Sustainability. URL: http://www.iclei.org/resources/publications/icleicase-studies.html
- Markevich, A. "The Evolution of Sustainability", in MIT Sloan Management Review. Fall (2009).
- Martin, R. and Osberg, S. "Social Entrepreneurship: The Case for Definition" in <u>Stanford Social Innovation Review</u>. Spring (2007), pp 28-39.
- Marquis. C. and Park, A. "Inside the Buy-One Give-One Model" in Stanford Social Innovation Review. Winter (2014).
- Mitra C. and Borza, A. "The Role Of Corporate Social Responsibility in Social Entrepreneurship" in <u>Management & Marketing</u> <u>Challenges for Knowledge Society</u>, 5/ 2 (2010), pp. 63-76.
- Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD). <u>Social Impact Investment: Building the Evidence Base</u>.
 Paris: February 2015.
- Puppim de Oliveira, J. (Ed.). <u>Green Economy and Good Governance for Sustainable Development Opportunities, Promises and</u> Concerns. Tokyo: United Nations University Press, 2012, pp 3-22.
- Praszkier, R. and Nowak, A. <u>Social Entrepreneurship: Theory and Practice</u>. New York: Cambridge University Press., 2012 (see Ch. 11: A New Kind of Leadership).
- Roy, K.C. and Tisdell, C.A. "Good governance in sustainable development: the impact of institutions,! In <u>International Journal of Social Economics</u>, 25. Iss. 6/7/8 (1998), pp. 1310-1325.
- Schwartz, B. Rippling: How Social Entrepreneurs Spread Innovation Throughout the World. Hoboken (NJ): Jossey-Bass, 2012.



• Van Vugt, M. and Griskevicius, V. "Going green? Using evolutionary psychology to foster sustainable lifestyles," in <u>World Social Science report</u>, (2013), pp. 312-315.

RECOMMENDED RESOURCES:

- Ashoka Deutschland gGmbH. URL: www.ashoka.org
- Corporate Social Responsibility Watch. URL: http://www.csr-watch.com/
- International Institute for Sustainable Development. URL: https://www.iisd.org/sd/
- Model Behavior 20 Business Model Innovations for Sustainability. URL: http://www.sustainability.com/
- Schwab Foundation for Social Entrepreneurship. URL: http://www.schwabfound.org/
- The Corporate Social Responsibility Newswire.URL: http://www.csrwire.com/
- The Skoll Foundation. URL: http://www.skollfoundation.org/

Appendix:

Rubric for course participation:

Excellent participation

The student's contributions reflect an active reading of the assigned bibliography. Skillfully synthesizes the main ideas of the readings and raises questions about the applications and implications of the material. Demonstrates, through questions and comments, that they have been capable of relating the main ideas in the readings to the other information discussed in the course and with their own life experience. The student makes informed judgments about the readings and other ideas discussed in class, providing evidence and reasons. They respectfully state their reactions about other classmates' opinions and can contribute to the inquiry spiral with other questions. The student gets fully involved in the completion of the class activities.

B Very good participation

The student's contributions show that the assigned materials are usually read. Most of the time, the main ideas are identified, even though sometimes it seems that applications and implications of the information read were not properly reflected upon. The student can construct over others' contributions, but sometimes seems to interrupt the shared construction to go over tangents. They are respectful of others' ideas. Regularly involved in the activities but occasionally loses concentration or energy.

C Regular participation

The participant evidences a regular reading of the bibliography but in a superficial way. They try to construct over others' ideas, but commonly provide comments that indicate a lack of preparation about the material. Frequently, contributions are shallow or unarticulated with the discussion in hand.

F Insufficient participation

Consistently, the participant reads in a shallow way or does not read at all. Does not participate in an informed way and shows lack of interest in constructing over others' ideas.