



ES/FO 330 SUSTAINABLE FOOD & AGRICULTURE
IES Abroad Granada Environmental Studies & Sustainability Program

DESCRIPTION:

The course sets out to equip students with a profound understanding of the complexity of food systems, agroecology and food sovereignty. It provides a broad overview of the manifold interlinkages between agriculture and food supply with regards to economic, ecological, social and individual well-being. By means of lectures, independent study and hands-on experiences, students will develop a personal approach to ecological food resources and learn how to use them in a sustainable manner. In this context, sustainability is referred to as the possibility of securing global nutrition in the long term, i.e. preserving ecological, cultural and social resources as well as interrelated systems.

CREDIT / CONTACT HOURS: 3 credits, 45 contact hours

PREREQUISITES: None

METHODS OF PRESENTATION:

- Lectures
- Discussions
- Exercises
- Field study
- Group work
- Role play/ debate
- Video clips
- Student presentations
- Independent study

Additional material will be posted on Moodle. This platform is also the place to share assignments and to follow recent developments in the field. Participation is part of the student's grade; therefore, all students are expected to contribute during classes.

ADDITIONAL COST: None

LANGUAGE OF INSTRUCTION: English

LEARNING OUTCOMES:

By the end of the course students will be able to:

- Critically evaluate literature on sustainable food and agroecology
- Analyze various stakeholders' perspectives and interests related to sustainable food and agriculture
- Assess their own food consumption habits and participation in industrial food systems
- Define the key criteria for sustainable food systems
- Describe different functions of ecosystems and key resources of agriculture
- Understand the concepts of food security and food sovereignty
- Design a map and guide on regional food supply

REQUIRED WORK AND FORM OF ASSESSMENT:

- Class Participation (10%)
- Oral presentation of individual research (25%)
- Reflection Journal (20%)
- Presentation of Group Work (20%)
- Final Exam (25%)

CLASS PARTICIPATION

Students are required to complete all reading assignments and will be expected to demonstrate this through regularly assigned homework, pop quizzes and/or insightful and relevant contributions to in-class discussion. All of these components will count toward the class participation grade. Participation also applies to course-related trips, outings /field study and/or special events in and around Granada. A rubric for participation is available in the appendix and on Moodle.

ORAL PRESENTATION OF INDIVIDUAL RESEARCH

The students will be assigned to one presentation topic by the instructor. They will prepare an overview of the given topic and connect it to the course content in an oral presentation. The presentation should include the most important points and background of the topic. The presentations will be a maximum of 10-15 minutes + 5 minutes for questions/ activity, using PowerPoint, a flip chart and/or print handouts. The presentations will be held in week 2. The time slots for the presentations will be assigned by the instructor. A draft of the presentation needs to be submitted the day before the presentation. A rubric for presentations is available on Moodle.

REFLECTION JOURNAL

Self-reflection is essential to developing one's understanding of the main academic concepts discussed in class and to reflect on one's own role in relation to sustainable food production, eating and consumption habits. Entries are directed assignments that require students to reflect on their academic experience in class, readings, field study and films. Journal entries (1000 words) are to be completed and submitted by the due date announced by the instructor at the beginning of the course (the submission deadline will be set at the beginning of week three). The journal must be submitted by e-mail or as an upload on Moodle.

PRESENTATION OF GROUP WORK (FOOD PROJECT/ECOMARKET PROJECT)

Presentation: a map and guide about food and agriculture in the Granada and surrounding region (Vega de Granada), including portraits of local plants, respective recipes, and further material such as pictures, articles etc. Students will be requested to self-organize the work, according to the tasks, topics and the academic framework given by the instructor. The presentation can be held using PowerPoint, posters and/or print hand-outs. A draft of the presentation needs to be submitted the day before the presentation. A rubric for presentations is available on Moodle.

FINAL EXAM

The final evaluation will be based on essay questions to display knowledge of course content and the ability to reflect on as well as to critically analyze and compare best practices. Possible topics may include: history of agriculture, wild edible plants, plant ecosystems, impact of diets on sustainability and related monitoring, concepts and practices of permaculture and organic agriculture, access to resources, urban agriculture, food processing, food distribution, concepts of food security and food sovereignty. Students will have 90 minutes to complete the exam in class.

ATTENDANCE POLICY:

Attendance at all classes, including course-related excursions, is mandatory. Rescheduling exams, tests, presentations, or other assignments is only possible in the event of documented medical or family emergencies. Exceeding two absences will result in a one-letter grade reduction for each additional absence (e.g., from B+ to B). Field trips are mandatory, and any unexcused absence will result in a one-letter grade reduction. Punctuality is critical: three instances of being over five minutes late will be counted as one absence and being more than 15 minutes late will also count as one absence.

TESTS, QUIZZES, OR PRESENTATIONS MISSED DURING UNEXCUSED ABSENCES CANNOT BE MADE UP! ASSIGNMENTS NOT HANDED IN ON THE DUE DATE WILL BE SUBJECT TO A 3% PENALTY PER DAY POST-DUE DATE (except of students who have an excused absence).

Updated information on your course and readings, including additional readings from journalistic articles, can be found on the Moodle platform at <https://moodle.iesabroad.org/login/index.php>

Week 1 – Cultural perspectives on agriculture and food

	Course Program	Assignments and Readings
Day 1	Introduction to course and topic - Welcome and introduction - Mind-Map exercise, lecture and discussion: why sustainable food & agriculture? - Assignment of topics and due dates for student presentations & reflection journals - Concept Anthropocene, John McNeill Georgetown University STAND UGR https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ZY9gS-N1hTM	Required reading: Parasecoli, The Food of History, pp. 5 – 29 https://openaccess.uoc.edu/bitstream/10609/49263/2/The%20Food%20of%20History.pdf Independent Study (tasks assigned): Milestones in the history of food and agriculture
Day 2	History of food and agriculture - Presentation of research for timeline and discussion: milestones in the history of agriculture and interrelations with societal developments. <i>What happens when agricultural products migrate?. The Columbian Exchange</i> - Introduction of Group Work assignment	Required readings: - Shaheen, Edible Wild plants: An alternative approach to food security, pp. 41-57, 59-64, 175-179 - Nabhan, G.P. et al (2013) <i>CONSERVATION YOU CAN TASTE Best Practices in Heritage Food Recovery and Successes in Restoring Agricultural Biodiversity over the Last Quarter Century</i> https://garynabhan.com/pbf-pdf/ConservationYouCanTaste.pdf Recommended: - Scott, James C. 2017. <i>Against the grain: A deep history of the earliest states</i>. New Haven: Yale University Press. (Ch. 2, <i>Landscaping the world: The domus complex</i>)
Day 3	“Natural” food / Urban foraging - Reflection on readings lecture: - Lecture: Nature – the food treasury. Biodiversity, ecosystems and services. - Outdoor learning activity: Ecomarkets and 0 Km Agriculture. Which plants can be found in our environment? What benefits do they have?	Required reading: - Sardeshabde, M. and Shackleton, Ch (2023) Fruits of the city: The nature, nurture and future of urban foraging https://doi.org/10.1002/pan3.10428 Recommended: https://ajuntament.barcelona.cat/ecologiaurban/a/en/what-we-do-and-why/green-city-and-biodiversity/urban-agriculture-strategy Independent Study
Day 4	Local food - the Granada example - Presentation of Red Agroecológica de Granada and A fuego lento (https://granadaafuegolento.com/#home-section) - Field study: What’s on offer at the Granada farmers’ markets, shops etc.? - Reflection and discussion on regional food supply in Granada	Required reading: Pascual H and Guerra JC (2024) Territory in urban food policies: the case of Spain. <i>Front. Sustain. Food Syst.</i> 8:1359515. doi: 10.3389/fsufs.2024.1359515 Research and mapping (for group work): podcast about local peasant and agroecology production in Urban Area Granada
Day 5	Agroecology Farming in region Granada Excursion to a regional farm with a guided tour. Insights on agricultural techniques in practice. Challenges and opportunities. El Cortijo del Pino, Churriana, Granada	Required reading: Peña-Rodríguez, F.-J.; Entrena-Durán, F.; Ivorra-Cano, A.; Llorca-Linde, A. Changes in Land Use and Food Security: The Case of the De La Vega Agrarian Shire in the Southern Spanish Province of Granada. <i>Land</i> 2023, 12, 747. https://doi.org/10.3390/land12040747

Week 2 – Methodological Approaches to Agri-food Systems

Day	Morning	Afternoon Assignments and Readings
Day 1	Gender, Agroecology and Food Sovereignty - Elements for building Feminist Agroecology - Care and Food Sovereignty in Global Perspectives	Required Reading: - Friends of the Earth “Dismantling Patriarchy while Building Food Sovereignty” https://www.foei.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/03/Friends-of-the-Earth-International_Dismantling-patriarchy-while-building-food-sovereignty_English.pdf https://www.cidse.org/2023/11/27/feminism-inside-the-agroecology-and-food-sovereignty-movement/ Recommended: - AAVV (2024) Embroidering care and reciprocity contributions to food sovereignty by feminist peasant women from the mountains of Veracruz, México. https://www.frontiersin.org/journals/sustainable-food-systems/articles/10.3389/fsufs.2024.1294043/full
Day 2	Political Agroecology - Agri-Food Systems and Territorial Identities. - Socioenvironmental Resistances in favor of Agroecology. “Other Political Scenarios for Territorial Governance”	Required Reading: - Jan Douwe van der Ploeg (2021) <i>The political economy of agroecology</i>, <i>The Journal of Peasant Studies</i>, 48:2, 274-297, DOI: 10.1080/03066150.2020.1725489 - Gliessman, S (2013) <i>Agroecology: Growing the Roots of Resistance</i>, <i>Agroecology and Sustainable Food Systems</i>, 37:19–31 DOI:10.1080/10440046.2012.736927
Day 3	Ecological Economics and Agri-Food Systems - Key Elements for Ecological Economy - Economic Dimension of Agroecology - Discussion about Anthropocene-Capitalocene	Required Reading: - Van der Ploeg, J.D. et al <i>The economic potential of agroecology: Empirical evidence from Europe</i>. <i>Journal of Rural Studies</i>, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jrurstud.2019.09.003 Recommended: - Haddad BM, Solomon BD (2024) Ecological economics as the science of sustainability and transformation: Integrating entropy, sustainable scale, and justice. <i>PLOS Sustain Transform</i> 3(2): e0000098. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pstr.0000098
Day 4	Designing Agroecological Transitions. - Agroecological Transition. How to rebuild connections environment-society - Social Metabolism and Social Organization - Public Policies. Global Perspectives.	Required Reading: - Ben M. McKay, Ryan Nehring & Georgina Catacora-Vargas (08 Oct 2024): <i>The political economy of agroecological transitions: key analytical dimensions</i>, <i>The Journal of Peasant Studies</i>, DOI: 10.1080/03066150.2024.2399138 Recommended: - Soini Coe, E, and Coe, R. 2023. Agroecological transitions in the mind. <i>Elem Sci Anth</i>, 11: 1. DOI: https://doi.org/10.1525/elementa.2022.00026
Day 5	Scaling up Agroecology, Emma Siliprandi (Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations)	https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=EHh8SGO0Xh4

Week 3. Principles, methods and technologies for sustainable agriculture-agroecology

Day	Morning	Afternoon Assignments and Readings
Day 1	Food Ecosystems - Lecture: Ecosystems as the basis of food production - Movie screening: Sustainable (2016), 93min. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=p39h0WMcitM - Reflection discussion in class	Required Reading: - Altieri, M. Agroecology: the science of natural resource management for poor farmers in marginal environments. <i>Agriculture, Ecosystems & Environment</i> Volume 93, Issues 1–3, December 2002, Pages 1-24 https://doi.org/10.1016/S0167-8809(02)00085-3 - Alison R. Holt, Anne Alix, Anne Thompson, Lorraine Maltby, (2016) Food production, ecosystem services and biodiversity: We can't have it all everywhere, <i>Science of The Total Environment</i>, Volume 573, 2016, Pages 1422-1429, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2016.07.139 Recommended: Heinrich-Böll-Stiftung, 2015, The Soil Atlas
Day 2	Essential natural resources for agriculture - Lecture: Key natural resources for food production. - Student presentations: research on related topics	Required Reading: - A Sustainability Challenge: Food Security for All: Report of Two Workshops (2012). Chapter: [Part I]: 3 NATURAL RESOURCES AND AGRICULTURAL PRODUCTIVITY https://nap.nationalacademies.org/read/13378/chapter/6 - The world food system: sustained improvement in food availability https://www.fao.org/4/y4683e/y4683e06.htm Optional watching: El Mundo según Monsanto
Day 3	Access to agricultural resources - Lecture and discussion: Access to seeds, land and water. Challenges to food supply. - Student presentations: research on related topics	Required reading: - Mohring, N. et al Farmers' adoption of organic agriculture—a systematic global literature review https://academic.oup.com/erae/advance-article/doi/10.1093/erae/jbae025/7824160? Recommended reading: Greenpeace, 2023, Nitrate Pollution in Water: A European Plague
Day 4	Sustainable agriculture and resource management - Lecture: Concepts and practices of sustainable farming (organic, regenerative, permaculture etc.) - Student presentations: research on related topics Workshop at urban garden in Granada (acc. to the season and needs): preparing compost beds, harvesting seeds, tilling/mulching, etc.)	Required readings: IFOAM Organics Europe (2023) Regenerative Agriculture & Organic. Position Paper. February 2023. https://www.organicseurope.bio/content/uploads/2023/02/IFOAMOE_PositionPaper_RA_final_202302.pdf?dd - Howard, Philip H., 1971- author. <i>Concentration and power in the food system : who controls what we eat? (Contemporary food studies: economy, culture and politics</i>, pp. 2-14. https://bnarchives.net/id/eprint/471/6/2016_howard_concentration_in_the_food_system_intro_ch01.pdf Exercise (instructions provided): prepare for role play discussion -> stakeholder cards
Day 5	Smallholders vs. industrial farms - Lecture: economics of agriculture and food. - Stakeholders, concentrations of power, external costs of agriculture. Role play discussion: small-scale organic farming vs. industrial agriculture	Required readings: Global Agriculture. Agriculture as a Crossroads https://www.globalagriculture.org/report-topics/industrial-agriculture-and-small-scale-farming/industrial-agriculture-and-small-scale-farming.html - Small Farmers bring food Security https://www.intracen.org/news-and-events/news/smallholder-farming-brings-food-security

Week 4 – Socio-economic aspects of food production

Day	Morning	Afternoon Assignments and Readings
Day 1	Sustainable food chains - Lecture: value-added food. Criteria for sustainable food products - Excursion to sustainable local food producer with insights on sourcing, processing and marketing	Required reading: - Sanz-Cañada J, Yacamán-Ochoa C and Perez-Campaña R (2024) Are agroecological cooperative supermarkets an alternative for scaling sustainable food? <i>Front. Sustain. Food Syst.</i> 8:1395819. doi:10.3389/fsufs.2024.1395819 - Michel et al., 2022, Opportunities and Challenges of Food Policy Councils <i>Front. Sustain. Food Syst.</i>, 19 October 2022, https://doi.org/10.3389/fsufs.2022.916178 Finalizing Reflection Journal
Day 2	Justice in food distribution - Reflection about readings and discussion on food policy councils/ food ecosystems - Lecture: economics of agriculture and food. Stakeholders, concentrations of power, external costs of agriculture - Discussion about food sovereignty and alternative economic models of food distribution Submission of Reflection Journal	Required reading: - López-García D, Cruz-Maceín JL and DiPaula M (2024) Agri vs. food? Perceptions of local policymakers on agri-food policies from a multilevel approach. <i>Front. Sustain. Food Syst.</i> 8:1399746. https://doi.org/10.3389/fsufs.2024.1399746 Recommended: - Annual Report 2017 LEIBNIZ CENTRE FOR AGRICULTURAL LANDSCAPE RESEARCH (ZALF) https://www.zalf.de/de/aktuelles/downloads/Documents/Jahresberichte/ZALF_Annual_Report_2017.pdf Finalizing draft for Group work presentation
Day 3	Changing perspectives: “prosumers” in agriculture - Reflection on readings lecture - Discussion: consumers influence on food systems? The power of consumers’ demand and active Submission of group work draft: “Sustainable food in Granada”	Required reading: Möhring, N. (2024) Farmers’ adoption of organic agriculture—a systematic global literature review. <i>European Review of Agricultural Economics</i> Vol 00 (00) (2024) pp. 1–33. https://doi.org/10.1093/erae/jbae025 Preparation for final exam and Group work presentation
Day 4	Final exam and Group work presentation - Final exam - Presentation of group work “Sustainable food in Granada” Final wrap-up and evaluation	

COURSE-RELATED TOPICS FOR STUDENT RESEARCH:

- CO2 capture in soils
- Diversity in seeds and species
- Integrated pest management
- Hydroculture, Aquaponics and Aeroponics
- Insects. Endangered species or food of the future?
- Practices of agroecology
- Water management in farming
- Food waste.

Note: this is a non-exhaustive list of potential topics for student research which shall refer to the topical structure of the course. Details will be discussed with the instructor and related sources for reading provided.

REQUIRED READINGS:

- Parasecoli, The Food of History, pp. 5 – 29 <https://openaccess.uoc.edu/bitstream/10609/49263/2/The%20Food%20of%20History.pdf>
- Shaheen, Edible Wild plants: An alternative approach to food security, pp. 41-57, 59-64, 175-179
- Nabhan, G.P. et al (2013) *CONSERVATION YOU CAN TASTE Best Practices in Heritage Food Recovery and Successes in Restoring Agricultural Biodiversity over the Last Quarter Century* <https://garynabhan.com/pbf-pdf/ConservationYouCanTaste.pdf>
- Sardeshabde, M. and Shackleton, Ch (2023) Fruits of the city: The nature, nurture and future of urban foraging <https://doi.org/10.1002/pan3.10428>
- Pascual H and Guerra JC (2024) Territory in urban food policies: the case of Spain. *Front. Sustain. Food Syst.* 8:1359515. doi: 10.3389/fsufs.2024.1359515
- Peña-Rodríguez, F.-J.; Entrena-Durán, F.; Ivorra-Cano, A.; Llorca-Linde, A. Changes in Land Use and Food Security: The Case of the De La Vega Agrarian Shire in the Southern Spanish Province of Granada. *Land* 2023, 12, 747. <https://doi.org/10.3390/land12040747>
- Jan Douwe van der Ploeg (2021) *The political economy of agroecology*, *The Journal of Peasant Studies*, 48:2, 274-297, DOI: 10.1080/03066150.2020.1725489
- Gliessman, S (2013) *Agroecology: Growing the Roots of Resistance*, *Agroecology and Sustainable Food Systems*, 37:19–31 DOI:10.1080/10440046.2012.736927
- Friends of the Earth “Dismantling Patriarchy while Building Food Sovereignty https://www.foei.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/03/Friends-of-the-Earth-International_Dismantling-patriarchy-while-building-food-sovereignty_English.pdf
- <https://www.cidse.org/2023/11/27/feminism-inside-the-agroecology-and-food-sovereignty-movement/>
- Ben M. McKay, Ryan Nehring & Georgina Catacora-Vargas (08 Oct 2024): The political economy of agroecological transitions: key analytical dimensions, *The Journal of Peasant Studies*, DOI: 10.1080/03066150.2024.2399138
- Altieri, M. Agroecology: the science of natural resource management for poor farmers in marginal environments. *Agriculture, Ecosystems & Environment* Volume 93, Issues 1–3, December 2002, Pages 1-24 [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0167-8809\(02\)00085-3](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0167-8809(02)00085-3)
- Alison R. Holt, Anne Alix, Anne Thompson, Lorraine Maltby, (2016) Food production, ecosystem services and biodiversity: We can't have it all everywhere, *Science of The Total Environment*, Volume 573, 2016, Pages 1422-1429, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2016.07.139>
- A Sustainability Challenge: Food Security for All: Report of Two Workshops (2012). Chapter: [Part I]: 3 NATURAL RESOURCES AND AGRICULTURAL PRODUCTIVITY <https://nap.nationalacademies.org/read/13378/chapter/6>
- The world food system: sustained improvement in food availability <https://www.fao.org/4/y4683e/y4683e06.htm>
- Mohring, N. et al Farmers' adoption of organic agriculture—a systematic global literature review <https://academic.oup.com/erae/advance-article/doi/10.1093/erae/jbae025/7824160?>
- IFOAM Organics Europe (2023) *Regenerative Agriculture & Organic. Position Paper. February 2023.* https://www.organicseurope.bio/content/uploads/2023/02/IFOAMOE_PositionPaper_RA_final_202302.pdf?dd
- Howard, Philip H., 1971- author. *Concentration and power in the food system : who controls what we eat? (Contemporary food studies: economy, culture and politics*, pp. 2-14. https://bnarchives.net/id/eprint/471/6/2016_howard_concentration_in_the_food_system_intro_ch01.pdf
- **Global Agriculture. Agriculture as a Crossroads** <https://www.globalagriculture.org/report-topics/industrial-agriculture-and->

[small-scale-farming/industrial-agriculture-and-small-scale-farming.html](#)

- Small Farmers bring food Security <https://www.intracen.org/news-and-events/news/smallholder-farming-brings-food-security>
- Sanz-Cañada J, Yacamán-Ochoa C and Perez-Campaña R (2024) Are agroecological cooperative supermarkets an alternative for scaling sustainable food? *Front. Sustain. Food Syst.* 8:1395819. doi:10.3389/fsufs.2024.1395819
- Michel et al., 2022, Opportunities and Challenges of Food Policy Councils *Front. Sustain. Food Syst.*, 19 October 2022, | <https://doi.org/10.3389/fsufs.2022.916178>
- López-García D, Cruz-Maceín JL and DiPaula M (2024) Agri vs. food? Perceptions of local policymakers on agri-food policies from a multilevel approach. *Front. Sustain. Food Syst.* 8:1399746. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fsufs.2024.1399746>
- Möhring, N. (2024) Farmers' adoption of organic agriculture—a systematic global literature review *European Review of Agricultural Economics* Vol 00 (00) (2024) pp. 1–33. <https://doi.org/10.1093/erae/jbae025>

Recommended Readings:

- Scott, James C. 2017. *Against the grain: A deep history of the earliest states*. New Haven: Yale University Press. (Ch. 2, *Landscaping the world: The domus complex*)
- <https://ajuntament.barcelona.cat/ecologiaurbana/en/what-we-do-and-why/green-city-and-biodiversity/urban-agriculture-strategy>
- AAVV (2024) Embroidering care and reciprocity contributions to food sovereignty by feminis peasant women from the mountains of Veracruz, México. <https://www.frontiersin.org/journals/sustainable-food-systems/articles/10.3389/fsufs.2024.1294043/full>
- Haddad BM, Solomon BD (2024) Ecological economics as the science of sustainability and transformation: Integrating entropy, sustainable scale, and justice. *PLOS Sustain Transform* 3(2): e0000098. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pstr.0000098>
- Soini Coe, E, and Coe, R. 2023. Agroecological transitions in the mind. *Elem Sci Anth*, 11: 1. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1525/elementa.2022.00026>
- Heinrich-Böll-Stiftung, 2015, *The Soil Atlas*
- Greenpeace, 2023, *Nitrate Pollution in Water: A European Plague*
- *Annual Report 2017 LEIBNIZ CENTRE FOR AGRICULTURAL LANDSCAPE RESEARCH (ZALF)* [https://www.zalf.de/de/aktuelles/downloads/Documents/Jahresberichte/ZALF Annual Report 2017.pdf](https://www.zalf.de/de/aktuelles/downloads/Documents/Jahresberichte/ZALF%20Annual%20Report%202017.pdf)

Appendix:

Rubric for course participation:

A	Excellent participation The student's contributions reflect an active reading of the assigned bibliography. Skillfully synthesizes the main ideas of the readings and raises questions about the applications and implications of the material. Demonstrates, through questions and comments, that he or she has been capable of relating the main ideas in the readings to the other information discussed in the course, and with his or her own life experience. The student makes informed judgments about the readings and other ideas discussed in class, providing evidence and reasons. He/she respectfully states his/her reactions about other classmates' opinions and is capable of contributing to the inquiry spiral with other questions. The student gets fully involved in the completion of the class activities.
B	Very good participation The student's contributions show that the assigned materials are usually read. Most of the time the main ideas are identified, even though sometimes it seems that applications and implications of the information read were not properly reflected upon. The student is able to construct over others' contributions, but sometimes seems to interrupt the shared construction to go over tangents. He/she is respectful of others' ideas. Regularly involved in the activities but occasionally loses concentration or energy.
C	Regular participation The participant evidences a regular reading of the bibliography, but in a superficial way. He/she tries to construct over others' ideas, but commonly provides comments that indicate lack of preparation about the material. Frequently, contributions are shallow or unarticulated with the discussion in hand.
F	Insufficient participation Consistently, the participant reads in a shallow way or does not read at all. Does not participate in an informed way and shows lack of interest in constructing over others' ideas.